

This pdf document contains the Table of Contents (Summary, plus 5 pages detailed) and sample text pages from the new 97-page 2010 edition of Natalie B. Choate’s Special Report “Roth-Ready for 2010!” REVIEW the Table of Contents to make sure this Report covers the questions you are interested in. READ the sample pages to make sure Natalie’s writing style suits you.

Everything You Need to Know to Get Your Clients

Roth-Ready for 2010!

by

Natalie B. Choate, Esq.
Nutter McClennen & Fish LLP
Boston, MA 02210-2604
(617) 439-2995
www.ataxplan.com

Summary of Contents

Acknowledgments	6
Abbreviations, Symbols, and Defined Terms Used in this Report	6
5.1 Roth Introduction: History, Definitions, Abuses	7
5.2 Roth IRAs: Minimum Distribution and Income Tax Aspects	11
5.3 Regular Contributions (& Seven Other Ways to Fund a Roth IRA)	21
5.4 Conversion of Traditional Plan or IRA to Roth IRA	26
5.5 Roth Plans and the 10% Penalty For Pre-Age 59½ Distributions	40
5.6 Corrective Distributions; Recharacterizations	46
5.7 Designated Roth Accounts	56
5.8 Beneficiary Roth Conversions	68
5.9 Putting it All Together: Roth Planning Ideas and Principles	74
Appendix A: IRA Contribution Limits	86
Appendix B: IRA or Plan Distribution That Contains After-tax Money	87
Appendix C: Forms	94
Appendix D: Unanswered Questions	96
Appendix E: Bibliography, Resources	97

Detailed Table of Contents

Acknowledgments	6
Abbreviations, Symbols, and Defined Terms Used in this Report	6
5.1 Roth Introduction: History, Definitions, Abuses	7
5.1.01 Introduction to Roth retirement plans	7
5.1.02 What practitioners must know	7
5.1.03 History of Roth retirement plans	8
5.1.04 Roth retirement plan abuses	9
5.1.05 Definitions: Direct, Indirect Rollovers; IRA-to-IRA transfers	10
5.2 Roth IRAs: Minimum Distribution and Income Tax Aspects	11
5.2.01 Roth (and deemed Roth) IRAs vs. traditional IRAs	11
5.2.02 Roth IRAs and the minimum distribution rules	12
A. No lifetime required distributions.	12
B. Post-death MRD rules do apply.	13
C. Roth <i>distributions</i> do not fulfill MRD requirement for traditional IRA.	13
D. MRDs and Roth conversions and recharacterizations	13
5.2.03 Tax treatment of Roth IRA distributions: Overview and miscellaneous	13
A. Qualified vs. nonqualified distributions	14
B. Which Roth IRAs are “aggregated.”	14
C. Actual vs. deemed distributions.	14
D. Basis issues.	14
5.2.04 Qualified distributions: Definition	15
5.2.05 Computing Five-Year Period for qualified distributions	16
A. Effect of recharacterization.	16
B. Contrast with DRACs.	16
C. Effect of DRAC rollover.	16
D. Computing Five-Year Period for beneficiaries.	16
5.2.06 Tax treatment of nonqualified distributions	17
5.2.07 The Ordering Rules	18
5.2.08 Tax treatment of Roth (and traditional) IRA losses	19
5.2.09 Investment management fees for Roth IRAs	20
5.3 Regular Contributions (& Seven Other Ways to Fund a Roth IRA)	21
5.3.01 The eight ways (I know of) to fund a Roth IRA	21
5.3.02 “Regular” contributions from compensation income	22
5.3.03 Applicable dollar limit on regular contributions	22
5.3.04 Who may make a “regular” Roth IRA contribution	23
5.3.05 Penalty for excess IRA/Roth IRA contributions	25
5.4 Conversion of Traditional Plan or IRA to Roth IRA	26
5.4.01 What type of plan may be converted to a Roth IRA	26
5.4.02 Who may convert: age, plan participation, income, etc.	27
A. Age: Under 59½, over 70½, or in between.	27
B. Participation in other plan(s).	28
C. Prior conversion.	28
D. Filing status.	28
E. Income limit.	29

5.4.03	Tax treatment of converting traditional IRA to Roth IRA	29
A.	A Roth conversion is a “taxable rollover”.	29
B.	Treatment of after-tax money in participant’s IRA(s).	29
C.	Realizing a loss on a Roth conversion.	30
5.4.04	Tax treatment of converting nonIRA plan to Roth IRA	31
A.	The fictional two-step process.	31
B.	If the plan contains after-tax money.	31
C.	After-tax money, continued: Partial rollover.	32
D.	Roth conversion of NUA stock.	33
E.	Withholding.	34
5.4.05	Income spreading for conversions in 1998 or 2010	34
5.4.06	Conversion of annuity contract	35
5.4.07	Mechanics of traditional-IRA-to-Roth IRA conversions	36
5.4.08	Mechanics of conversion from other traditional plans	37
5.4.09	Pre-2010 income, filing status, tests for conversion eligibility	38
A.	Filing status	38
B.	Income test: \$100,000 limit	38
C.	Income test: Definition of MAGI	38
D.	Effect of one-year suspension of MRDs	39
5.5	Roth Plans and the 10% Penalty For Pre-Age 59½ Distributions	40
5.5.01	Penalty applies to certain Roth plan distributions	40
A.	Distribution eligible for exception	40
B.	Qualified distribution	41
C.	Nonqualified distributions from Roth IRA	41
D.	Nonqualified distribution from DRAC	41
E.	Conversion followed by distribution within five years	41
5.5.02	Roth conversion prior to reaching age 59½	41
5.5.03	Roth conversion pre-age 59½: More explanation, examples	42
5.5.04	Conversion while receiving “series of equal payments”	45
5.6	Corrective Distributions; Recharacterizations	46
5.6.01	How to undo a regular Roth IRA contribution	46
A.	Return the contribution	46
B.	“Absorb” the contribution	47
5.6.02	How to recharacterize certain IRA/Roth IRA contributions	47
A.	Recharacterizing a regular contribution to either type of IRA.	48
B.	Recharacterizing a Roth conversion.	48
C.	Rules applicable to all recharacterizations.	48
D.	Which contributions can NOT be recharacterized.	49
5.6.03	Deadline for Roth IRA contributions and conversions	50
A.	Deadline for “regular” contribution.	50
B.	Deadline for “conversion” contribution	50
5.6.04	Recharacterization deadline: Meaning of “extended due date”	51
A.	October 15 if return is timely filed	52
B.	April 15 if return is filed late	52
C.	Disaster relief; “9100” relief.	52
5.6.05	Income attributable to the contribution	53
5.6.06	Partial recharacterizations	54

5.6.07	Same-year and immediate reconversions prohibited	54
5.6.08	Recharacterization by the executor	55
5.7	Designated Roth Accounts	57
5.7.01	Meet the DRAC: Roth 401(k)s, 403(b)s	57
5.7.02	DRAC contributions: Who, how much, how, etc.	57
A.	Who may contribute	57
B.	How much may be contributed	58
C.	Election is irrevocable	58
D.	What may be contributed to a DRAC	59
E.	FICA taxes	59
5.7.03	MRDs and other contrasts with Roth IRAs	59
5.7.04	DRACs: Definition of “qualified distribution”	60
A.	Qualified distribution triggering events	60
B.	How the Five-Year Period is computed for a DRAC	60
C.	List of never-qualified distributions	61
D.	QDROs and payments to beneficiaries	62
5.7.05	Nonqualified DRAC distributions	62
5.7.06	Rollovers of DRAC distributions: General rules	63
5.7.07	DRAC-to-DRAC rollovers	63
A.	May roll to any other DRAC	63
B.	Direct rollover	64
C.	Total direct rollover preserves basis in excess of value	64
D.	Direct rollover preserves holding period	64
E.	60-day (“indirect”) rollover	64
5.7.08	DRAC-to-Roth-IRA rollovers	65
A.	Who is eligible.	65
B.	Minimum distribution effects.	65
C.	Effect on basis recovery.	65
5.7.09	DRAC-to-Roth IRA rollovers: Effect on Five-Year Period	65
A.	Rollover of a qualified distribution	66
B.	Rollover if participant has a pre-existing Roth IRA	66
C.	Danger: Rolling nonqualified distribution to a new Roth IRA	67
D.	Rollover when basis is higher than market value	67
5.7.10	Employer obligations; other DRAC details	68
5.8	Beneficiary Roth Conversions	68
5.8.01	Background: Nonspouse beneficiary rollovers	68
5.8.02	How the Code allows some beneficiary Roth conversions	70
5.8.03	Limitations on nonspouse beneficiary Roth conversions	70
5.8.04	Problems: Eligibility tests; multiple beneficiaries	71
5.8.05	Planning implications: Beneficiaries who will NOT roll to Roths	72
5.8.06	Beneficiaries who WILL roll to Roths	72
5.8.07	Implications for clients retiring or leaving their jobs	73
5.9	Putting it All Together	74
5.9.01	Which is better, a Roth plan or a traditional plan?	74
5.9.02	Reasons to adopt a Roth retirement plan	75
5.9.03	Risks, drawbacks, of Roth retirement plans	76

5.9.04	Annual contributions: Traditional IRA vs. Roth IRA	76
5.9.05	Choosing between a DRAC and a traditional 401(k)/403(b)	77
5.9.06	The battle of the spreadsheets	77
5.9.07	Establishing Roth IRAs for low-income relatives	78
5.9.08	How a Roth conversion can help the participant	78
A.	Take advantage of lower brackets; reduce future MRDs	78
B.	Above average life expectancy	79
C.	Control income levels for Social Security, Medicare, purposes	79
D.	Protection from creditors	80
5.9.09	How participant's conversion helps beneficiaries	80
A.	Reduce estate taxes	80
B.	Low bracket parent, high bracket children	80
C.	Simplify beneficiaries' lives	80
D.	Or is a traditional IRA better?	80
5.9.10	Preparing for 2010	81
A.	For the cheapest conversion, avoid "diluting" basis	81
B.	For a "free" conversion, isolate basis	81
C.	Create something to convert if you have nothing now	81
D.	If you already have basis, increase it	81
E.	Novel ways to increase basis	82
F.	If you do not already have basis, don't try to get some unless you can really get a lot	82
G.	Convert early in 2010?	82
H.	Take MRD before converting.	82
I.	Don't roll money into an IRA in same year as the conversion.	83
5.9.11	Convert now, decide later?	83
A.	Estimated taxes for the conversion year	83
B.	Recharacterization deadline	84
C.	What if you die in the middle of this?	84
5.9.12	Practicalities: Should you roll to separate Roth IRAs?	84
A.	Convert to separate Roth IRA, to make recharacterization easier?	84
B.	Convert different assets into different Roth IRAs?	85
5.9.13	Roth plans and the estate plan	85
Appendix A: IRA Contribution Limits		86
Appendix B: IRA or Plan Distribution That Contains After-tax Money		87
2.1.09	Determining basis in a traditional IRA	87
2.1.10	How much of IRA distribution is basis?	88
2.1.11	Exceptions to the cream-in-the-coffee rule (IRAs)	91
2.1.12	Determining basis in inherited IRAs	92
2.1.13	Cream-in-the-coffee rule and nonIRA plans	92
Appendix C: Forms		94
Form 1:	Different Beneficiaries for Roth, Traditional, Accounts in a Plan	94
Form 2:	Will Provision: Roth IRA Conversions	95
Appendix D: The Unanswered Questions		96
Appendix E: Bibliography, Resources.		97

This is a sample of the *technical tax material* in the Special Report (pages 16–17, explaining how to compute the “Five-Year Period” that is one of the requirements requisite to having tax-free qualified distributions from a Roth IRA):

5.2.05 *Computing Five-Year Period for qualified distributions*

Satisfying a five-year waiting period (called in this Report “the Five-Year Period”) is one of two tests a Roth IRA owner must pass in order to have tax-free “qualified distributions” (¶ 5.2.04) from his Roth IRA. The Five-Year Period (called in the statute the “nonexclusion period”) for *all* of a participant’s Roth IRAs begins on January 1 of the first year for which a contribution was made to *any* Roth IRA maintained for that participant. § 408A(d)(2)(B); Reg. § 1.408A-6, A-2.

Fred Example: On August 3, 1999, Fred put \$1,000 into his Roth IRA. Fred’s Five-Year Period starts January 1, 1999, and is completed on December 31, 2003. The first year in which he can possibly have a qualified distribution is 2004. If he makes further contributions (either regular or rollover) to the same (or any other) Roth IRA, those contributions do NOT start a new Five-Year Period running. In 2006, Fred converts his \$100,000 traditional IRA to a Roth IRA. This new Roth IRA instantly meets the Five-Year Period requirement, because Fred has already completed the Five-Year Period for every Roth IRA he will ever own. If Fred is already over age 59½, he can immediately take qualified distributions from his newly-created Roth IRA in 2006.

Note the following points regarding calculation of the Five-Year Period for a Roth IRA:

- A. **Effect of recharacterization.** If a Roth IRA contribution is entirely recharacterized (¶ 5.6.02), it is treated as if it had never been made. Thus, in the Fred Example above, if Fred had recharacterized his 1999 Roth IRA contribution, that contribution would not start the Five-Year Period running.
- B. **Contrast with DRACs.** The Five-Year Period is computed differently for a designated Roth account (DRAC). ¶ 5.7.04(B).
- C. **Effect of DRAC rollover.** The method of computing the Five-Year Period for a Roth IRA does not change just because the Roth IRA receives a rollover from a DRAC, regardless of how long the DRAC had been in existence. See ¶ 5.7.09.
- D. **Computing Five-Year Period for beneficiaries.** The method of computing the Five-Year Period for a Roth IRA does not change (“is not redetermined”) just because the Roth IRA owner dies. The deceased participant’s holding period carries over to the beneficiary. If the beneficiary is the surviving spouse, she gets to carry over the deceased participant’s holding period even if she elects to treat the Roth IRA as her own Roth IRA, so in effect she gets to use her own holding period or the deceased spouse’s holding period, whichever is longer. Reg. § 1.408A-6, A-7(a). For more on the spousal rollover and spousal election to treat an inherited IRA as the surviving spouse’s own IRA, see ¶ 3.2 of *Life and Death Planning for Retirement Benefits*.

Scott Example: Scott contributes to his first Roth IRA in 2008. His Five-Year Period will therefore be completed December 31, 2012. He dies in 2010, leaving the Roth IRA in equal shares to his wife (age 45) and daughter. The wife and daughter divide the account into two separate equal Roth IRAs, one payable to each of them. The wife elects to treat the separate Roth IRA payable to her as her own Roth IRA.

For Scott's daughter, the Five-Year Period for her inherited Roth IRA will be completed December 31, 2012, because she gets to "carry over" Scott's holding period. Accordingly, for the daughter, all distributions after 2012 will be "qualified distributions," because she will have met both the Five-Year Period requirement and the triggering event requirement (Scott's death was the triggering event for her inherited Roth IRA).

For the Roth IRA payable to Scott's wife that she has elected to treat as her own, the election erases Scott's death as a triggering event, because the Roth IRA is now considered her own Roth IRA (not an inherited Roth IRA), and she owns it as participant (not beneficiary). For distributions after 2012 she will have met her Five-Year Period requirement, based on *Scott's* holding period, which she gets to carry over. If she had started her own Roth IRA prior to 2008 (the year Scott started his), her Five-Year Period will be based on her own Roth IRA. But regardless of which holding period start date applies, she will still not have qualified distributions from this or any of her other Roth IRAs until she attains age 59½ or becomes disabled, etc.

5.2.06 *Tax treatment of nonqualified distributions*

A nonqualified distribution is one made before the Five-Year Period (§ 5.2.05) is up; or which is made after expiration of the Five-Year Period but not for one of the specified reasons (age 59½, disability, death, etc.; § 5.2.04). A nonqualified distribution is not *per se* excludible from gross income. However, even if a distribution is not "qualified" it receives favorable tax treatment compared with distributions from a traditional IRA.

A Roth IRA contains two types of money. First, it contains the participant's contributions; since these amounts were *already* included in the participant's gross income, these originally-contributed funds will not be included in his income *again* when they are later distributed. Thus, the amount of the participant's original contribution(s) to the Roth IRA constitutes the participant's basis (or "investment in the contract") in the Roth IRA. § 72(b)(2). If the account has grown to be worth more than the investment in the contract, the rest of the account value (which represents the earnings and growth that have occurred since the original contribution; the IRS calls this portion the "**earnings**") has not yet been taxed (and may *never* be taxed if it is distributed in the form of a qualified distribution).

The general rule is that all distributions from a Roth IRA are deemed to come *first* out of the participant's contributions. § 5.2.07, #1. Thus, if the participant or beneficiary wants to get money out of the Roth IRA, but does not meet the requirements for a qualified distribution, he can still withdraw money income tax-free, up to the amount the participant contributed.

Jules and Jim Example: In 2007, Jules converted his \$400,000 traditional IRA to a Roth IRA. He dies in 2009, leaving the account (now worth \$500,000) to his son Jim. Jim wants to use the "stretch" life-expectancy payout method for this inherited Roth IRA. Accordingly, he must start taking minimum required distributions in 2010. Jules's death is a "triggering event," but the Five-Year Period will not be up until December 31, 2011, so the distributions Jim is forced to take in

This is a sample of the *planning advice* in the Special Report (pages 72–73, discussing the planning implications of the new “beneficiary Roth conversion,” whereby certain nonspouse beneficiaries are allowed to convert certain inherited nonIRA plans into “inherited” Roth IRAs):

5.8.05 *Planning implications: Beneficiaries who will NOT roll to Roths*

For a nonspouse Designated Beneficiary who inherits a QRP, 403 plan, or governmental 457(b) plan, the nonspouse beneficiary plan-to-Roth-IRA rollover offers an intriguing planning possibility. A beneficiary may want to consider rolling all or part of the inherited plan to an inherited Roth IRA via direct rollover. Probably not too many beneficiaries will want to do this because:

1. The beneficiary may not be able to afford to pay the income tax cost of a Roth conversion.
2. If the beneficiary is eligible and can afford a Roth rollover, the beneficiary would usually be better off converting his/her *own* plan or IRA to a Roth IRA status rather than converting the inherited plan:

Daphne Example: In 2010, Daphne inherits a \$200,000 401(k) plan from her deceased mother (all pre-tax money) and she also has a \$200,000 IRA of her own. She wants to have a \$200,000 Roth IRA and can afford to pay the income tax on a \$200,000 Roth conversion, but cannot afford to convert *both* plans to Roth IRAs. If she converts her own IRA to a Roth, she: will not have to take any MRDs from it during her entire life; and can leave it, at her death, to a Designated Beneficiary who can take tax-free distributions over such beneficiary’s life expectancy. In contrast, if she converts the *inherited* plan to an *inherited* Roth IRA, she will have to immediately start taking MRDs, over her own single life expectancy as beneficiary; and whatever is left in it at her death, her successor beneficiary will have to withdraw over what is left of Daphne’s life expectancy. So there is much more deferral-potential “bang for the buck” in converting your own IRA or plan to a Roth IRA than in converting an inherited plan to an inherited Roth IRA.

5.8.06 *Beneficiaries who WILL roll to Roths*

However, that being said, there will be some cases where the beneficiary will want to roll an inherited plan to an inherited Roth IRA:

1. An eligible individual who is so in love with Roth IRAs that he/she wants to convert BOTH his/her own plans and IRAs AND the inherited plan to Roth IRA status.
2. If the inherited plan contains after-tax money, it would be cheaper to convert the inherited plan than to convert the beneficiary’s own plan, if the beneficiary’s plan is all pretax money.
3. If the deceased participant’s estate was subject to federal estate taxes, the beneficiary will be entitled to apply the “IRD deduction” (income tax deduction for federal estate taxes paid on the benefits) to the conversion. Like after-tax money (#2), this factor could make the

conversion of the inherited plan “cheaper.” See § 691(c) and ¶ 2.3.04 of *Life and Death Planning for Retirement Benefits* regarding this deduction.

4. Any beneficiary who really wants a Roth IRA, but does not have a plan or IRA of his/her own that he/she can convert—especially if he/she expects his/her income tax bracket to be higher in the future.

Frank Example: Frank is age 40 and working. He has a 401(k) plan. He’d like to convert part of this plan to a Roth IRA in 2010, but he cannot take a distribution from his 401(k) plan (that could be rolled to a Roth) until he reaches age 59½ or terminates employment—by which time he expects to be in higher bracket. He inherits a plan from his father; he can convert that inherited plan to an inherited Roth IRA right now while he is in a low bracket.

Sarah Example: Sarah and Jane are spinster sisters who live together. Jane has a high income from her job, and substantial wealth. She supports Sarah who does not work. Jane dies in 2009, leaving her 401(k) plan and other wealth to Sarah. Sarah is in a low tax bracket; she expects her tax bracket to increase once Jane’s estate is eventually transferred to her. Sarah has no plan or IRA of her own she can convert to a Roth IRA. She has Jane’s 401(k) plan balance transferred directly to an inherited Roth IRA.

5.8.07 Implications for clients retiring or leaving their jobs

George Example: George is retiring at age 65 from XYZ Corp. He has a \$200,000 401(k) plan balance. He also owns a \$1 million IRA, all pre-tax money. He does not expect to be reemployed again ever. Should he roll over his 401(k) balance to an IRA? Or should he leave it where it is?

There are many factors to consider in making the decision whether to roll money out of a company plan, including creditors’ rights, investment control, and fees, just to name a few. The new plan-to-Roth-IRA rollover option, and Notice 2008-30, created a new reason why George might want to leave the money right where it is instead of rolling it over to an IRA: When George dies, if the money is still in the 401(k) plan, his nonspouse Designated Beneficiaries will have the option to roll the inherited plan to an inherited Roth IRA. If George rolls the money to an IRA now, his nonspouse beneficiaries will not be able to convert the inherited IRA to an inherited Roth IRA.

Does this factor mean that George should not roll over to an IRA? Not necessarily. For example, if George is leaving his retirement benefits to his spouse or to charity, he can ignore this factor. But this new factor must enter in to the decision process; something new for your “rollover checklist”!

[end of sample pages]